Stories on the go Mobile, digital cultural heritage and participation on 1001 stories of Denmark

Corresponding author

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen
Associate Professor
Institute for the Study of Culture,
University of Southern Denmark
Campusvej 55, 5230 Odense M
Tel +4524984219
hvidtfeldt@sdu.dk

Abstract

The article focuses on 1001 Stories of Denmark: an internet site and a mobile app that collects and displays stories and visual material connected to places all over Denmark. This site offers a "social media-like" communication frame with various levels of participation. But in reality, 1001 stories of Denmark is mainly a one-to-many dissemination of expert knowledge, and actual user participation is limited. However, the site does host user-generated material, e.g. a number of amateurish videos and stories that often do not follow the guidelines, but in some cases construct willful and affective narratives. I argue that these videos and stories demonstrate the potential of mobile and digital cultural heritage sites; however, it requires strategic initiatives and long-term engagement from museums and cultural institutions to create and maintain the level of the dialogue and participation.

Keywords

Cultural heritage,

museum communication, participation,

apps, experience economy

One Thousand and One Stories

The title *One Thousand and One Nights* traditionally refers to a collection of stories and folk tales of mixed ancestry collected during the Islamic Golden Age. It is framed with a narration of the king's wife Scheherazade, who initiates a new story every night in order to be allowed to live for another day to finish her story.

1001 stories of Denmark is a national digital communication project developed in 2008-2009 and launched in 2010 by the National Heritage Agency (Kulturarvsstyrelsen) and the Danish communication agency Advice Digital.[1] The project *1001 stories of Denmark* consists of a website and an app for smartphones or tablets, where stories about locations ("1001 fantastic cultural heritage sights"[2]) in Denmark are organized on a digital map, a timeline, and in a number of themes. The Danish Agency of Culture chose the first places and selected 180 "experts" to write the first 1001 stories of 200 words each.[3] Users can create a personal profile and contribute with new stories similar to the traditional *One Thousand and one (Arabian) Nights*. The users of *1001 stories of Denmark* are supposed to set up new places, upload pictures, links, and videos and follow well-known ways of communicating and expressing views on Facebook or Instagram: to comment on the posts made by others and "tag", "like", "follow" and "share" the postings. However, users have not done this to a great extent.

In this article I focus on the contents of *1001 stories of Denmark* in order to examine how the extended geo-spatial opportunities, offered by digital and social media technologies, succeed in engaging people in cultural heritage dialogues as part of their everyday lives and experiences, and how this (digital and mobile) participation can be understood in relation to the paradigm of experience economy (Drotner, 2011; Falk & Dierking, 2013; Giaccardi, 2008). Based on the theory of participation (Arnstein, 1969) and heritage and participation culture (Giaccardi, 2012; Simon, 2010), I present close readings of selected user-generated postings from *1001 stories of Denmark*. I include critical perspectives on social media (Dean, 2009; Dijck, 2009) and on experience economy (Hein, 2000) in order to address the challenges of participation within the area of digital cultural communication.[4]

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

History "to go"

1001 stories of Denmark is one among a number of Danish cultural heritage apps introduced during recent years. Museums and cultural heritage institutions worldwide have developed combinations of internet sites and smartphone apps through which the users are offered information and narrations about the historical places they pass or are guided to them. The *Historical Atlas* was made available on the internet from 2005, at first as a small local museum project in Odense, and from 2006 onwards it extended to a larger part of Southern Denmark.[5] The *Aarhus Street Museum* was launched in 2011 by *The Old Town* in Aarhus (*Den Gamle By*) and has come to resemble the *London Street Museum* and the *Street Museum NL*. In 2012, *Roskilde Museum* was honored with the "Audience award" by the Danish *Bikuben Foundation* for their digital street exhibition *Voices from the Past*.[6] And finally, *Historiejagt Fyn* (History Hunt Funen) has been launched in 2014 as a family friendly digital entry to cultural heritage on location.[7]

1001 Stories of Denmark is, however, the only one of the Danish apps that allows users to contribute with their own stories and visual material. On the website, the app is described as follows:

> There are stories from all over Denmark - from the Iron Age settlement "Sorte Muld" ("black soil") on the island of Bornholm, to the Black Horse Cavern in the Copenhagen borough of Vesterbro. From the island of Christiansø in the East of Denmark to the chemical factory Cheminova in the West. From Broendums Hotel in the North by Skagen to the burial mound Baunehøj at Lolland in the South of Denmark.
>
> Stories on the go
> You can access the site by GPS, mobile phone and iPhone/Android Market, which allows you to cycle around the city or drive around the country and on the go listen to stories about famous places or perhaps discover interesting new areas, castles or historic highs.

Contribute and share

The website is user driven so everyone can contribute with comments, photos and stories and recommendations and you can place new dots on the map if you think we're missing something, or if you have an interesting story about a place.

The stories are written by 180 of the country's foremost experts on cultural heritage and history, but we need you to develop the site. There are already many new places added to the 1001 stories we started out with.[8]

1001 stories of Denmark emerged as a part of an "experience project" in 2008-2011 initiated by the National Heritage Agency. The communication agency Advice Digital, who developed the digital interface for *1001 stories of Denmark*, claims to "boost new life into the past with this site and app. Geotags and user-generated contents make historical places come alive – on location". Thus, the digital dissemination is thought to present cultural heritage in new and authentic surroundings, but at the same time to challenge and reconsider the fundamental idea of heritage communication and integrate (the affective ways of communicating known from) social media with (the credibility of) expert knowledge. On their website, Advice Digital makes use of a rhetoric that proceeds from a binary opposition between an old and a new museum, as they declare to do "away with the dusty museum atmosphere, come lively visual design, short stories of places near you."[9] Thus, Advice Digital revives stereotypical perceptions of the museum as a boring and "dusty" archive and introduces a new way of communicating using the positively loaded adjectives "lively", "short", and "near". They associate notions of an exclusive "one way communication" with the old-fashioned way of being a museum and suggest instead to:

"turn the users into coauthors on the 1001 geotagged spots on the cultural heritage map of Denmark. Let them make profiles, recommend places to each other and share their own experiences. Everybody can contribute with content and develop the site."[10]

According to Advice Digital, "nobody believes in advertising". Today, "you believe in your friends and their recommendations. The stories are also a part of our collective mind as Danes. This is added value […]"[11] Thus, Advice Digital indirectly refers to the user-driven communication on e.g. commercial websites like Trust Pilot, Trip Advisor, or AirBnB, and the way that participatory digital

culture in many ways has reorganized the way people engage with one another, whether concerning public matters (business, politics, education) or private issues (e.g. Facebook or dating sites) (Giaccardi, 2012: 4). According to Advice Digital, now also the creation and dissemination of heritage must be framed as a bottom-up user-driven procedure, connected to communities and the sharing of individual and joint experiences.

Experience and participation

Boswijk, Thijssen, and Peelen's book *The Experience Economy. A new perspective* highlights six characteristics for a meaningful experience that fluctuate closely with the ideas behind *1001 Stories of Denmark*. A meaningful experience involves "all senses" and a "heightened sense of concentration and focus". It "alters one's sense of time", "one is touched emotionally", "the process is unique for the person and has an intrinsic value" and establishes "contact with one's environment by doing and undergoing things" (Boswijk, Thijssen, & Peelen, 2008: 27). *1001 Stories of Denmark* offers personal communication through the electronic device of the user's own choice and through a unique individual profile, which displays the interests of the user in question. Through the possibility of participation, new connections are supposed to be created between users, their surroundings, their past, and each other. As Boswijk, Thijssen, and Peelens argue, the meaningful experience is a personal one: "Indeed, in the new generation of the experience economy, the personal experience forms the focal point" (Boswijk et al., 2008: 12). Also, museum research suggests a user-oriented and personal approach to communication. Falk and Dierking state that no museum in the 21st century can afford to dictate the needs of the users top-down, nor can anyone expect that the same type of experience fits and satisfies all. Museums need to think in specific target groups (Falk & Dierking, 2013: 298) and create 'experiences' *with* the audience.

In Sherry Arnstein's classical text "Ladder of Citizen Participation", she suggests eight levels of 'participation' with an increasing degree of personal influence. Thus, Arnstein's scale ranges from 'nonparticipation' in terms of manipulation and therapy, three steps of symbolic participation ('tokenism') in the form of the 'informing level', 'consultation', and 'placarion' to the top levels of 'partnership', 'delegated powers', and actual 'citizen control' as top rung of the ladder (Arnstein, 1969). Moreover, in her book *The Participatory Museum,* museum researcher Nina Simon also emphasizes the importance of personal and individual communication strategies reframed by her as

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

a step towards collaborations. Accordingly, the personal approach is the means rather than the end. Simon grades the concept of 'participation' on a scale of five steps from 'me' to 'we', thereby measuring the level of interaction both between the institution and the user and between the users themselves (Simon, 2010 26). She divides participation into four levels, which indicate the different levels of museum control in relation to cooperation and content: 'contributory' (where the institution wants users to feel like participants but also to establish the conditions) , 'collaborative' (where the museum is included in a partnership with identified target groups and guided by the wishes of the users in the process and towards the outcome), 'co-creative' (where the target group's ideas are autonomous, museum staff supervise), and 'hosted' (where the museum provides frameworks and resources available and allows users to fill them as they please) (Simon, 2010: 191).

1001 Stories of Denmark is not created by a museum, but presents, according to the authority of the National Heritage Agency, a model of heritage communication that underlines the importance of creating experiences and enabling user participation, not least among new target user groups. The paradigm of the experience economy has had a decisive influence on Danish cultural institutions and their strategies of dissemination during the last decade, as museums and other cultural institutions (e.g. public libraries) have been required to adapt to new market economic structures. In continuation of this paradigm, they have developed a new self-understanding as open and knowledge-producing institutions aiming to reach out to audiences in different ways. Thus, it seems that digital and social media technologies support the direction that cultural politicians, museum theorists, and professionals stipulate. Yet, the question remains: why does the project *1001 stories of Denmark* not quite fulfill the expectations?

Democratic affordances of digital media
Within recent cultural theory, participation in digital media brings about both hope and doubts. Optimistically, cultural heritage dissemination through digital media is thought to break down former boundaries between institution and audience, experts and users, by letting users get in 'touch' with the past through mobile phone applications. Along with the paradigm of experience economy, new technologies and forms of digital communication have been said to have created and empowered an audience "demanding the right to participate within the culture" (Jenkins, 2006: 24).

The World Wide Web was "envisioned as a new frontier space where grass root initiatives, communal spirit and 'free' amateur culture had a chance to blossom." New hybrid terms such as 'Pro-sumer, 'co-creater', and 'prod-user' describe the users' and customers' new roles as well as new levels of influence, as users are invited to climb the participatory ladder, as described by Arnstein. New mixed models of labor deconstruct former oppositions of 'hobbyists' and 'amateurs' and 'volunteers' vs. 'professionals', 'stars', 'paid experts', and 'employees' (Dijck, 2009: 50).

The mobile phone has great potential for personal/individual communication, affective engagement, and social participation, as the phone seems to be the object that most people today are more closely attached to than anything else.[12] "The iPhone enables new kinds of verbal, visual, tactile, affective and sensory communication" as the touch screen facilitates sensual communication (touching, swiping, enlarging) (Goggin, 2012: 21). The mobile phone has been described as "an affective extension to the self" (Karatzogianni & Kuntsman, 2012: 248), in many ways comparable to Du Gay's analysis of the Sony Walkman described as "virtually an extension of the skin. It is fitted, moulded, like so much else in modern consumer culture, to the body itself … It is designed for movement – for mobility, for people who are always out and about, for travelling light. It is part of the required equipment of the modern 'nomad' … it is testimony to the high value which the culture of late-modernity places on mobility" (Du Gay, 1997: 23-24). Today, this is the function of the smartphone: a combination not only of a mobile telephone and a portable music player but also a portable computer, calendar, game console, source of news, social media etc.

José van Dijck counters the binary understanding of a passive audience linked to the "old" electronic media forms like radio, TV, and points to an (inter)active audience having arisen with the "new" digital media. In opposition to e.g. Jenkins, Dijck stresses that "'participation' is an ambiguous concept. The presumption that new networked technologies lead to enhanced involvement of recipients as well as to active cultural citizenship is rather generalizing" (Dijck, 2009, p. 45-46). More than 80% of the internet users are passive consumers: spectators or inactives (also Simon, 2010: 8). Users take multiple roles and only few are actual contributors.

Similarly, American cultural critic Jodi Dean argues pessimistically that digital communication (blogging, social networks, Twitter, YouTube) provides "an imaginary site of action and belonging" (Dean, 2009: 43), where "people enjoy the circulation of affect that presents itself

as contemporary communication. The system is intense; it draws us in. Even when we think we aren't enjoying, we enjoy (all this email, I am so busy, so important […]") (Dean, 2010: 95). But it is, according to Dean, a trap that captures people's minds: "I argue that this trap takes the form of that modern European philosophy heralded as the form of freedom: reflexivity. Communicative capitalism is that economic-ideological form wherein reflexivity captures creativity and resistance so as to enrich the few as it placates and diverts the many" (Dean, 2010: 4).

With these questions and theoretical frameworks in mind, I will turn towards the concrete contents of *1001 Stories of Denmark* in order to identify the potential in and challenges of *1001 Stories of Denmark,* with a particular focus on evaluating the aspects of participation and the relation between expert and user-generated content.

1001 Stories of Denmark
The concept of culture on *1001 Stories of Denmark* is broad and covers both what could be called "highbrow culture" (museums, national monuments, art, churches) and everyday culture or the "whole way of life", in Raymond William's sense. The first 1001 stories include elements of established Danish cultural heritage, e.g. Kronborg and "Himmelbjerget" (The Heaven Mountain) and well-known tourist attractions like the Tivoli Garden and Legoland. However, the highest rated place is the Pilot Grill (Danish: "Flyvergrillen"), a fast food café and takeaway place that offers customers a front-row view of the Copenhagen airport runway.[13] Among the chosen places are also the suburban shopping mall "City 2" located in a suburb close to Copenhagen and a video of the "Motorway junction between Holbæk motorway and Motor ring 3".[14]

The stories are organized and placed within a number of thematic groups, the most popular of which are "Industry - From mills to computers", "World War II - Sleeping with the enemy", and "Denmark as a colonial power - Spices, sugar, slaves and a special relationship". Within each theme, the stories are organized on a visual timeline and on a map of Denmark. The "Industry" theme consists of 70 stories, a few date as far back as 1640 ("Sæby Watermill") and 1650 ("Hellebæk"), but most are from the mid-18th century and forward, with the highest density of stories around the 1920s. Their placement on the map shows where the stories are geographically located and that they are spread all over Denmark. Interestingly, however, and the geographical aspects notwithstanding, the diversity in terms of the content has turned out to be limited.

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

All stories in "Industry - From mills to computers" are marked as "selected entries", which means that the author is one of the 180 "experts" appointed to write and upload stories. Some of the writers have produced quite a few narratives. Of the 70 short narrations in the Industry theme, 28 stories are written by the same author.[15] In fact, all authors of the stories in this theme hold an academic degree in history or a related discipline, and the majority works as museum managers or professionals.[16] Thus, an expert clearly is defined by having recognized academic skills, and no user-generated content is integrated in the thematic groupings. Ordinary users can comment, tag, rate, and recommend the theme and the individual stories, but users have not done so to any large extent regarding the selected entries. It is automatically specified how many comments are given for each entry, but because the comments are not translated, they are, also, not retrievable in the English version. Six users recommend "Industry – From Mills to computers".[17] Three of these users are employees of the Danish Agency of Culture, another two are authors of "selected entries".[18]

Many of the user profiles on *1001 Stories of Denmark* in general – even the most popular ones – have no or very few followers. Actually, only one user has more than 10 followers, and this happens to be the chief editor of the website herself (Mette Bom). Also, the next people on the list of most popular users are Danish Agency of Culture employees. Ranked as number eight and nine, both with five followers(!), are former Danish Minister of Culture Per Stig Møller and a popular Danish musician Pernille Rosendahl, well known from e.g. the Danish X Factor show.[19] In comparison, Pernille Rosendahl has more than 8000 likes on her Facebook fan page.[20]

When using the GPS on a smartphone or the "map" or "places" on *1001 Stories of Denmark* as entrance*,* the posts submitted by experts and users appear side by side or even mix, as is the case at the Gendarme Path close to the German boarder in southern Jutland. This specific case has one (selected) entry written by Mie Ellekilde, whose profile reveals that she holds an MA in history and works as a curator at the Museum of Southern Jutland in Denmark. The entry is accompanied by a photo of the path and consists, in the English translation, of these 134 words:

> "In 1988, the South Jutland County as it was then suddenly realised the potential of the gendarme pathways. Not as paths defining the Danish-German border, but as a fantastic chance to explore the countryside. The county therefore began re-establishing selected parts of the gendarme pathways. First in line for a facelift was the south-eastern section of the system of pathways around Als because of the nearby coast and the lovely landscape. Today, you can follow in the gendarmes' footsteps

from Padborg to Høruphav on South Als – a route that covers 74 kilometres. It's easy to find, as the signs along the way are decorated with a gendarme in his blue uniform. At several locations, you'll also find the old border stones that mark where the gendarmes once walked and the old border ran."[21]

The entry is followed by 98 photos, and more than 90 of these images have been uploaded by a single user (Christina Krogh Meilandt) from 2010-2012.[22] Ten users claim to have visited the Gendarme Path, only one of whom is a museum professional[23], and none are "experts" in the sense that they have themselves contributed with 'selected entries' to the site.

Mailandt's photos display various angles of the Gendarme Path under different weather conditions and seasons. They are almost all provided with titles and short statements, e.g. "Can you predict the future in the stars, Gendarme?"[24], Where did I lose the battle? Philistine, Ethicist, Esthetician and Aesthetician, the battle is lost."[25], "Until death do us part. Does death take other forms, than the heart that stops beating?"[26], or "Once upon a time there was a border path which tells a story of the human need of establishing a defense".[27] Thus, she uses the place and its history as metaphors to describe her own life situation (the passing of time, seeking a "path", struggling, defending oneself, etc.) while she rhetorically addresses the path as a personal interlocutor. She quotes Danish philosopher Søren Kierkegaard and imitates the poet H.C. Andersen ("Once upon a time"). All in all, the combination of images and affective statements on Meilandt's posting "Gendarme Pathways" is a documentary and poetic project that demonstrates a personal way of creating meaning within the given framework and indicates the potential of geospatial dialogue.

Personal storytelling – breaking the rules

Nina Simon strongly recommends that museums "scaffold" their participation activities in order to secure that users are familiar with the institution's framework and expectations for participation and the subsequent use of what might be produced by it. On *1001 stories of Denmark* the "selected entries" can be said to act as scaffolding, as they showcase the desired length and format of the narration and illustrations.

Interestingly, the users who do participate on *1001 stories of Denmark* in many cases choose not to follow the "suggested templates", as they post narrations that are often much shorter or

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

longer than the recommended 200 words, or they post visual material of an extended length.[28] And Mailandt is by no means the only user who chooses not to follow the guidelines.

"The shipwreck at Sealand's Point January 6th 1948" (Forliset ved Sjællands Odde den 6. januar 1948[29]) is an extensive historical record that consists of 3515 words (more than 17 times the recommended length). The narration describes how a ship is grounded during a stormy night in the winter of 1847-48 at Sealand's Point. The author merges the narration of the sinking of the ship with a dramatic story of the later murder of the ship owners and their positions during the Second World War and the German occupation of Denmark.

Compared to this posting, the narration entitled "The clash of urbanisation and nature" (Kurt Loftkjær: Bydannelsens sammenstød med naturen[30]) is on the other hand remarkably short, as it consists of only the letter "x". There is one comment on the posting, which shows to be a 7500 word narration (written by Freddy Hjortespring Christensen). He shares an extensive story of how his parents managed to acquire a site at Bagsværd Lake, 12-13 kilometers outside Copenhagen, and how this working class family came to live in nice and rural surroundings during the summer months of the post-World War II era. He describes the family's financial situation, the do-it-yourself-way of recycling materials when building the summerhouses. He explains the development of sanitation and transportation from bicycle to scooter, the purchase of the family's first car, and the expectation of light trains in the 1960s. Blended into the dense description are small side stories about the local community: how one man has a daughter who he finds to be too tall to be considered anyone's girlfriend, how her father tragically dies from his injuries after a traffic accident on a scooter, how somebody's cocker spaniel is taught to do spectacular tricks, and about yet another neighbor who loves the smell of roses.

The above-mentioned F.H. Christensen has not contributed with any actual stories or places, and the site search engine does not systematically list the comment material. On his profile, he describes himself as a happily retired engineer specifically interested in nature, science, people, travelling, technology, computers, photography, his house and gardening, bicycle rides, and veteran Vespa scooters. Kurt Loftkjær, on the other hand, is an active user who has created 51 places and 76 stories. More than 20 of these consist of only an "x", maybe because he intends to add the narration later. Except from the above-mentioned narration, Loftkjær's places or narrations have not gained

any likes or comments. His profile tells us that he has a Master's in Science in Engineering and that he is, also, chair of the local Danish Society for Nature Conservation in the suburban area of Gladsaxe with a special interest in making Gladsaxe's nature protected areas and monuments visual.

Thus, the *1001 Stories* allow a very broad variety of material of both very personal and semi-political nature. *1001 Stories of Denmark* has, according to Digital Advice, approximately 600-1,000 users per day, and since 2010 users have uploaded more than 8,000 new pictures, 600 new locations, thousands of tags and links.[31] As stated by Simon and Dijck, most users do not contribute at all (Dijck, 2009; Simon, 2010). But, as is also evident, active participants often take up quite a lot of space and are free to upload more or less what they want as *1001 Stories of Denmark* practices almost no censorship.

The selected entries are most often illustrated by one or two images. In contrast, the amount of pictures uploaded by e.g. Mailandt is overwhelming. A comparable entry is Lise Pedersen's 106 photographs displaying her old merchant house and park from 1827. The pictures are followed by very short text pieces, a brief description of the expected process of restoring the house in its original manner, an open invitation to visit the place, and a contact email.[32]

Generally, the number of contributions, including user-generated video material, is low. A number of videos have been produced by semi-professionals (selected entries), although they are not explicitly marked as such. They are two to three minutes long, dynamic, and unpretentious videos recorded with handheld cell phones at various locations, and so they scaffold video contributions by suggesting a format that can be produced by any ordinary user.

However, for instance in the area of military installations of the past, the site hosts a vast amount of video material that, again, does not follow the recommended formats. *1001 Stories of Denmark* holds a theme named "War and peace. Military installations of the past". Here, 95 "expert stories" of military places, buildings, and defensive installations from across historical periods are gathered and displayed. Alongside these stories, users have uploaded pictures, stories, and extensive amateur video documents of former military fortresses (e.g. Bagsværd Fort: 14.13 minutes, Flakfortet 2007: 20.09 minutes, Fortun Fort 2012: 22.05 minutes, Trekroner 2013: 22.31[33]). These are recorded with handheld cameras, but compared to the above-mentioned videos, they are

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

**Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755**

extremely slow and detailed affective registrations of places. Like Mailandt and Pedersen, these videos tell of a place-specific local history from the outskirts of Denmark and from a personal point of view.

Regarding the video format, the scaffolding provided on the site is not obvious or clear. But the case is also that *1001 Stories,* frequently, is being used to circulate user-generated content from already existing platforms. The videos of military fortresses are uploaded by several users onto *1001 Stories,* but it turns out that they are all produced by Per Otto Allin and are also available on his personal channel on YouTube and via the Facebook group "Fæstningens venner" (The Fortresses' Friends)[34]. Likewise, Mailandt's pictures are posted on her profile on Facebook as well. And while the story entitled "The shipwreck at Sealand's Point" was uploaded by Vagn Rønberg, towards the end, however, it has been stated that the story is in fact an excerpt from a report from the local archive written by someone called Jørgen Nielsen[35].

Following Nina Simon's model of participation, *1001 Stories of Denmark* is merely a "host" for users who want to share and circulate stories and visual material. And circulation of the material seems to be more important than traditional notions of authorship and exclusive publishing, as argued by Jodi Dean (Dean, 2009) This turns out not to be sufficient for the creation of meaningful participatory experiences on mobile digital media. According to Nina Simon's model, *1001 Stories of Denmark* lacks the middle levels described as "collaboration" and "co-creation" with the users. On Arnstein's ladder of participation, most activities on *1001 Stories* would reach the steps of symbolic participation. Some of the most personal, e.g. Mailandt's plentiful pictures and creative combinations of text and image, might in Arnstein's term be classified as "nonparticipation" in terms of therapy.

Challenges and potentials

All in all, *1001 stories of Denmark* consists of a very uneven mix of contributions. It seems obvious both that *1001 Stories of Denmark* does not fulfil the claims made by the developers – and that the site has great potential for cultural communication.

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

The user-generated comments might be plentiful in numbers, but they are very brief. Actually, many comments are not retrievable – not even in the Danish version. Out of the ten users who testify to having visited the Gendarme Path, five of these users no longer exist, other than as dead links. Also, long discussion threads are a rare sight. In several cases, users have asked questions directly to the expert, but authors have not answered. Quite a few of the user-generated stories are identical duplicates, which also indicates that the site is not edited on a very frequent basis (e.g. Loftkjærs).

On the Danish Wikipedia site, *1001 Stories of Denmark* was set up as a separate entry, but was shortly after nominated for deletion.[36] On the "talk" page, a discussion unfolded, where proponents argued that big public projects like *1001 Stories of Denmark* are encyclopedically relevant. Critics deemed the level of content to be "disastrously low" and found it "downright embarrassing" that a governmental authority could stand behind something like this.

Sletningsforslag: 1001 fortællinger om Danmark [redigér]

Se evt. på *Wikipedia:Sletningsforslag*

1001 fortællinger om Danmark har fået påsat {{notabilitet}} af Knud Winckelmann. Jeg har på opfordring bragt forslaget lidt mere frem her, så det kan blive diskuteret.

- Behold - Jeg mener godt, at artiklen kan beholdes trods den nylige lancering. Dette skyldes det officielle i websitet samt den pænt lange historie bag. --Arne (Amjaabc) 15. maj 2010, 10:54 (CEST)
- Behold - At det er nyt gør det ikke nødvendigvis mindre notabelt - Nico 15. maj 2010, 11:11 (CEST)
- Behold--Lcl 15. maj 2010, 11:18 (CEST)
- Behold, har argumenteret for det!--mvh Per (PerV) 15. maj 2010, 11:26 (CEST)
- Behold Jeg mener at projekter, der bliver iværksat for skattemidler og henvender sig til almindelige skattebetalere er encyklopædisk relevante. Nillerdk 15. maj 2010, 11:46 (CEST)
- Kommentar Finansieringen afspejler vel donorernes opfattelse, i dette tilfælde altså den danske stat. Staten kan (som alle andre investorer) tage fejl – Uge 40 er et eksempel på et langvarigt projekt, hvis encyklopædi-relevans er usikker. --Palnatoke 15. maj 2010, 12:45 (CEST)
- Slet Efter at have set de artikler, der forekommer omtalte sted, er jeg enig med Knud Winckelmann. At det er en statlig myndighed, der står bag, er direkte pinligt. Niveauet er under ethvert lavmål. Jeg vil ikke afvise muligheden at en kulturel myndighed påpeger de værdier, der findes rundt om i Danmark (Skov- og Naturstyrelsens foldere om statsskovene er et glimrende eksempel), men det foreliggende er katastrofalt ringe. At danske skatteydere betaler for dette er uforståeligt. Det minder mest af alt om det sløseri, der finder sted i EU med skattemidler uden noget som helst tilsagn fra skatteyderne. Relevansen for Wikipedia er efter min opfattelse fraværende. Wikipedia kan omtale og henvise til lødige offentlige websites, men behøver ikke at reklamere for alt det bras, inkompetente offentlige myndigheder finder på.--Rmir2 15. maj 2010, 20:40 (CEST)
  - Kommentar Kvaliteten af en hjemmeside er ikke i sig selv en begrundelse for at dømme en Wikipedia-artikel ude. Noget andet er naturligvis brugen af den som kilder fra diverse andre artikler. --Arne (Amjaabc) 15. maj 2010, 21:53 (CEST)
  - Kommentar Hvis vi skruer niveauet så langt ned, får vi nok at gøre med at skrive om alverdens hjemmesider oprettet af revl og krat.--Rmir2 15. maj 2010, 22:10 (CEST)
- Slet - Ikke fordi det er en ny side, men fordi jeg ikke kan se, at 1001 Fortællinger om Danmark er notabel ud over den pressemeddelelse som Kulturarvsstyrelsen udsendte den 5. maj. Det er muligt, at hjemmesiden på et tidspunkt gør sig bemærket, men som det er i dag, har den ikke sat de store fodaftryk. --Pugilist 16. maj 2010, 23:37 (CEST)

Konklusion:
Beholdes
- Sarrus (d • b) d. 29. maj 2010, 16:30 (CEST)

Redigér · Overvåg · Se kun dette sletteforslag

1001 Stories of Denmark lacks continuous professional attention, which might have been provided if a museum had been behind the site, and staff had been appointed to undertake the task. The experiment of *1001 Stories of Denmark* shows that it is not possible to create a framework and leave the users to themselves, "the design of technical infrastructure is not sufficient." (Giaccardi, 2008: 284). Users will not engage and commit if professional editors do not initiate actual cooperation with the users. Collective storytelling must be facilitated in order to encourage private contributions and to include them in public conversations (Giaccardi, 2008: 292-93)**.** *1001 Stories*

of Denmark lacks this kind of structured, editorial approach and process-oriented engagement over time. The democratic power of digital social media has shown to be limited, as structures of power are not actually challenged (Dean, 2009; Dijck, 2009).

1001 Stories of Denmark demonstrates the potential of mobile digital communication in relation to the creation and dissemination of culture and history. This analysis shows that users want to share both stories and visual material and actually have substantial content to disseminate. Both the narrations of the "The shipwreck at Sealand's Point" and the comment by Freddy Hjortespring Christensen potentially could have broad appeal. Christensen's comment is an autobiographic, personal memory and family history, but at the same time, it is a cultural statement, and many Danes will be able to recognize both the structure of modern 20th century urbanization and the affective levels of his memories. The narration is written with a high degree of engagement and fictionalization and has, like the "Sealand's Point" contribution, a potential to spike general interest, but the length and the rhetoric makes it incomprehensible. The shipwreck still lies in the water at Sealand's Point, and the area has developed into a popular beach area close to many holiday homes, leaving summer guests every year to wonder about the rusty wreck close to the shore. Thus, the user-generated postings supplement the "selected entries" with personal, meaningful experiences with the potential of establishing contact with other users and the environment.

Boswijk et al. state that "…co-creation can only be successful if the customer and his values form the focus and a structured approach is followed, in which the customer functions as co-creator" (Boswijk et al., 2008: 165), and there are many ways in which the user-generated postings and participation might be improved by simple means: e.g. the editors could divide the very long narrations into smaller units, and they could provide an interview with a contributor like Freddy Christensen. The photos on Mailandt's posting should be reduced in numbers and organized in a more welcoming manner. Likewise, the videos should be edited and abbreviated and supplemented with contextual comments as a service to readers who have no previous knowledge of the topic.

As Hein underlines, creating experiences is not just another activity for museum professionals. It has fundamentally changed the system of values in the museum institution and in cultural heritage production from ontological object and archive-based activities to the production of experiences measured by their phenomenological value. She underlines the importance of

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

maintaining a variety of experiences and carefully evaluated them (Hein, 2000: 16). This analysis emphasizes the fact that projects like *1001 Stories of Denmark* need continuous critical, qualitative evaluations in order to reach its potential.

In the original Arabian 1001 Night's Stories, Scheherazade manages to stay alive by continuing her stories. The focus on personal communication and experiences of culture, together with the invention and spread of smartphones and mobile tablets provide new possibilities for the storytelling to continue, but it also challenges us in terms of developing the formal framework and organizational background and the potential to optimize the use of these options.

References

Arnstein, S. R. (1969). A Ladder of Citizen Participation. *JAIP, Vol. 35*(No. 4), 216-224.

Boswijk, A., Thijssen, T., & Peelen, E. (2008). *The experience economy: a new perspective*. Amsterdam: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Dean, J. (2009). *Democracy and other neoliberal fantasies: communicative capitalism and left politics*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Dean, J. (2010). *Blog theory: feedback and capture in the circuits of drive*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Dijck, v. J. (2009). Users like you? Theorizing agency in user-generated content. *Media, 31*(1), 41-58.

Drotner, K. (2011). *Det interaktive museum* (Vol. 1. udgave). Frederiksberg: Samfundslitteratur.

Du Gay, P. (1997). *Doing cultural studies: the story of the Sony Walkman* (Vol. Reprint). London: Sage, in association with The Open University.

Falk, J. H., & Dierking, L. D. (2013). *The museum experience revisited*. Walnut Creek, Calif.: Left Coast Press.

Giaccardi, E. (2008). The social production of heritage through cross-media interaction: making place for place-making. *International Journal of Heritage Studies, 14*(3), 281-297. doi: 10.1080/13527250801953827

Giaccardi, E. (2012). *Heritage and social media: understanding heritage in a participatory culture*. New York, NY: Taylor and Francis.

Goggin, G. (2012). The iPhone and Communication. In L. Hjorth, J. Burgess & I. Richardson (Eds.), *Studying mobile media: cultural technologies, mobile communication, and the iPhone* (Vol. Routledge research in cultural and media studies, pp. 11-27). New York, NY: Routledge.

Hein, H. S. (2000). *The museum in transition: a philosophical perspective*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press Washington, D.C.

Jenkins, H. (2006). *Convergence culture: where old and new media collide*. New York: New York University Press.

Karatzogianni, A., & Kuntsman, A. (2012). *Digital cultures and the politics of emotion: feelings, affect and technological change*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Simon, N. (2010). *The participatory museum*. Santa Cruz, Calif.: Museum.

[1] http://advicedigital.dk/case/1001-fortaellinger/ (page accessed 28.2.14)

[2] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB (page accessed 28.2.14)

[3] The "expert narratives" are marked as "selected entry" (from Danish: "Udvalgt bidrag"). Only these are translated into English, not the user-generated entries. *1001 Stories of Denmark* was launched on May 5th 2010 and supported by DKK 7,4 million from the Danish Labour Market Holiday Fund (Dansk Feriefond).

[4] My analysis combines qualitative and quantitative data. I have collected the number of users from Digital Advice and the Danish Agency of Culture (Kulturarvsstyrelsen/Kulturministeriet). As a registered member of the *1001 Stories* mailing list, I have received an auto-generated narration every day throughout 2013. From the Danish Agency of Culture I have received lists of and gone through all user-generated pictures until the first half of 2013.

[5] http://historiskatlas.dk/, http://blog.historiskatlas.dk. *Historical Atlas* is a digital project concerned with digitizing and disseminating local history and heritage and has historical maps as their point of departure. Access to this material would normally require visits to various local archives, libraries, or museums. *Historical Atlas* released a smartphone app in 2012 (developed by the independent company 'WOERK'), and it experienced a surprisingly large amount of downloads in the Copenhagen area. Although no content was available there, a collaboration with the *1001 Stories of Denmark* app was established. Thus, *Historical Atlas* now covers all of Denmark – but the original mapping part is still localized in Southern Denmark. *Historical Atlas* is currently organized as a society of participating museums, archives, and libraries.

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755

[6] *Voices from the Past*, an exhibition that consisted of painted cardboard figures placed in front of selected buildings in and around Roskilde. Each character had a code to scan or manually enter on a smartphone or tablet, which would activate a short narration that was, in many cases, historically correct, but was fictionalized and told from a personal point of view.

[7] http://www.kulturregionfyn.dk/historiejagt-fyn

[8] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/about (page accessed 28.2.14)

[9] (My translation from: "Væk med støvet museumsstemning, ind med sprælsk visuelt design og korte historier om steder nær dig". http://advicedigital.dk/case/1001-fortaellinger/. (page accessed 21.2.14)

[10] "Glem envejsformidling, gør i stedet brugerne til medfortællere på eksperternes 1001 geotaggede nedslag på kulturarvens Danmarkskort. Lad dem oprette profiler, anbefale steder til hinanden og dele egne oplevelser. Alle kan bidrage til med nyt indhold til historierne – og til udviklingen af selve sitet." http://advicedigital.dk/case/1001-fortaellinger/ (page accessed 21.2.14)

[11] "Det brugerdrevne aspekt er båret af, at man i dag ikke tror på reklamer og kommercielle opfordringer. Man tror på sine venner og andre almindelige menneskers anbefalinger, så den tendens rammer vi. Fortællingerne er samtidig en del af en kollektiv bevidsthed, som vi har som danskere. Det er *added value*," siger Kulturstyrelsens kommunikationschef Mette Bom. http://advicedigital.dk/case/1001-fortaellinger/. (page accessed 21.2.14)

[12] The number of Danes who own a smartphone or a tablet has increased explosively during the last three to four years (63% of all Danish households have at least one smartphone and the share of families with a tablet has extended over a period of two years from 9 % to 33 %). Statistics Denmark http://www.dst.dk/pukora/epub/Nyt/2013/NR225.pdf (page accessed 25.2.14)

[13] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/flyvergrill (page accessed 25.2.14)

[14] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/city-2/stories/out-of-town-shopping-precinct & http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/motorway-junction-between-the-holbaek-motorway-and-motorring-3/videos (pages accessed 26.2.14)

[15] Kathrine G. Bjerregaard. On her profile the only information is that she holds a Master's degree in history and philosophy.

[16] e.g. Henrik Harnow has written nine of the stories, and Frank Allan Rasmussen has written seven. Caspar Jørgensen is a historian specializing in the area of the industrial society and the culture of the welfare state and works as a consultant in the Danish Agency of Culture. he has written an overview article of about 1,000 words on the theme as well as three of the stories.

[17] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/theme/industry/followers (page accessed 21.2.14)

[18] Thus, only one of these is an "ordinary" user: René Clausen Nielsen presents himself on his profile as having grown up in the northern part of Jutland, has a Master's in sociology and social science from Copenhagen and now lives in Maputo.

[19] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/profiles/popular (page accessed 24.2.14)

[20] https://www.facebook.com/#!/pages/Pernille-Rosendahl-Official-fanpage/108554739179962 (page accessed 24.2.14)

[21] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/en_GB/gendarme-pathways (page accessed 25.2.14)

[22] Special / ressourcepædagog. Mennesker og livet er fuld af gentagelser! Lige smukke hver gang. (special ed teacher)

[23] Peter Storm, chairman of Museum Middelfart and writer.

Karen Hvidtfeldt Madsen

**Conjunctions. Transdisciplinary Journal of Cultural
Participation, vol. 1, no. 1, 2014. ISSN 2246-3755**

[24] "Kan du skue fremtiden på stjernerne, Gendarm?" http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/gendarm-stien/images (page accessed 21.2.14)

[25] "Hvor tabte jeg slaget? Spidsborger, Etiker, Æstetiker og religiøs, slaget er tabt".

[26] "Til døden os skiller. Er døden i flere afskygninger, end blot i form af hjertet der stopper med at slå?"

[27] "Der var engang en grænsesti. Den fortæller en historie om menneskets behov for at opbygge et forsvar".

[28] When you are on the *1001 Stories* mailing list, you receive a randomly chosen story every day. My aim has been to select entries that in different ways challenge the framework of *1001 Stories*.

[29] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/sjaellands-odde-gniben/stories/forliset-ved-sjaellands-odde-den-6-januar-1948 (page accessed 25.2.14)

[30] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/skovbrynet/stories/bydannelsens-sammenstoed-med-naturen (page accessed 25.2.14)

[31] http://advicedigital.dk/case/1001-fortaellinger/ (page accessed 25.2.14)

[32] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/havehuset-sommerhus-for-aarhusiansk-koebmand-i-kaempe-park-med-flotte-traeer

[33] http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/bagsvaerd-fort/videos/newest/1/0a39db40-1307-49bb-ac27-60bcd65ebeb7, http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/flakfortet/videos/newest/1/df9147ca-a439-45b1-8522-7b18484f5a63, http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/fortun-fort/videos/newest/1/9e78bd6d-649e-4d20-8818-765db4c5ecca, http://www.kulturarv.dk/1001fortaellinger/da_DK/trekroner/videos (pages accessed 28.2.14)

[34] http://www.youtube.com/channel/UCIM4x98YMljpykw3-ZjSGqw, https://www.facebook.com/#!/groups/faestnin-gens.venner/, (page accessed 25.2.14)

[35] "Ovenstående er ifølge Odsherred Lokalarkiv et uddrag af Jørgen Nielsens beretning "Glimt af Slæbedamperen S/S Castor's (af København, 1875-1948) liv og undergang"

[36] http://da.wikipedia.org/wiki/Diskussion:1001_fort%C3%A6llinger_om_Danmark (page accessed 25.2.14)