Sometimes, a few words may stand as a genuine symbol for a whole movement. In spite of all the dangers of slogans, a fragmentary text becomes itself an appropriate symbol, a "watchword", a "parole", a "Losung". In the twentieth century movement for liturgical renewal in the Roman Catholic Church, the famous phrase from a 1903 motu proprio of Pius X has functioned in this way. The indispensable source of the true Christian spirit for "all the faithful," this letter tells us, is "active participation in the holy mysteries". Indeed, when "the holy mysteries" are taken to mean the actually enacted signs of the liturgy as full of the presence and reality of the triune God, and when "all the faithful" is taken to indicate the full, local congregation, then this call for "participation" may be seen as representing the leading edge of reform in the liturgies of all the Christian churches in the twentieth century, not just that of the churches in communion with Rome. The classic phrase from a Roman letter has become an ecumenical treasure, illuminating an abiding truth about "church" for us all.

It is as if the phrase became a watchword, especially in the hands of the great teachers Lambert Beauduin and Virgil Michel. That watchword could be seen as receiving the nineteenth century history of liturgical recovery and calling for that recovery to turn now toward twentieth century ecclesial and cultural concerns. Without the turn represented by this phrase, the nineteenth century movement could and did run out in a variety of phenomena which late twentieth century liturgists regarded as misdirections: romantic ceremonialism, imaginary reconstructions of the middle ages, or the use of the liturgy to support either ultramontanism or extreme nationalism. But with this turn, the liturgical movement could remember the original genius of its social-critical search for community and turn the strength of its historical recoveries toward the well-being of participatory local assemblies. Pius X's phrase may be seen to bear fruit in that remarkable text of the Second Vatican Council:
To accomplish so great a work, Christ is always present in his church, especially in the liturgical action. ... By his power he is present in the sacraments, so that when someone baptizes it is really Christ who baptizes. He is present in his word, since it is he himself who speaks when the holy scriptures are read in the church. He is present, finally, when the church prays and sings, for he promised: »Where two or three are gathered together in my name, there am I in the midst of them«.3

But the phrase from the motu proprio may also stand for much of the agenda of the parish communion movement in the English church or the best of the liturgical achievement of the Church of South India or the agenda of the Associated Parishes in the Episcopal Church of the United States or the ecumenical work of the Liturgical Conference in North America.

Was there a similar »turn« in the liturgical movement among the Lutheran churches? Was there a similar way in which the nineteenth century recovery of early-Lutheran sacramental and liturgical interests was so re-addressed toward current congregational life and current social need that an ecumenically important and abidingly significant illumination of »church« occurred? Many of the North American or German critics of Lutheran liturgical reform do not think so. While there is some truth to their criticism, I think these critics have not seriously read Nikolaj Frederik Severin Grundtvig nor attended to the best of his legacy.

Indeed, earlier than the papal writing Grundtvig, too, was seeking for »participation«. It was found, he argued, in the full communal engagement in that apostolic confession of faith which gives an enduring center to the church:

... when I refer to the confession of faith at baptism of the ancient church I am referring to the audible »Yes – Amen« of the congregation«.4

Grundtvig, too, was alive to the liturgical presence of the »mystery of Christ«. With characteristic Lutheran insight, he called it »the living word«:

The fact that the Word from the mouth of the Lord is spoken to all of us at baptism and communion is the one true foundation for the faith of all Christians, old and young, wise and uninformed. This Word from the mouth
of the Lord is the foundation for light and life; it is the rock and the sun, enlightening and enlivening in the Spirit of the Lord, which never deviates from what he has said.\footnote{5}

And, with his remarkable skill for the memorable poetic word, Grundtvig himself crafted a hymnic phrase which has stood as a sort of summary watchword for his insight, his \textit{mageløse opdagelse}, his »unparalleled discovery«:

\begin{quote}
\textit{Kun ved Badet og ved Bordet}
\textit{Hører vi Guds Ord til os.}\footnote{6}
\end{quote}

(Only at the bath and at the table, do we hear God’s word to us.)

It is a word echoed in many of his hymns and elaborated in many of his sermons\footnote{7}. Indeed, if »God« here is taken to be the full presence of the life of the holy Trinity and if the assembly around »bath« and »table« is seen to include an opening toward all that is human, then this text can be seen to represent authentically the irreducible heart of Grundtvig’s work. Even the »only«, the \textit{kun}, of the text can be seen as bringing to expression an important characteristic in the writings of Grundtvig: the polemical warmth with which he resisted both protestant rationalist exegesis and biblicism as foundations for the church.

This accent on baptism and eucharist as the living word of God amid a participating, Sunday-gathering, »amen«-saying, singing, confessing congregation »produced its own kind of liturgical movement«, observes Kenneth Stevenson,\footnote{8} »\textit{en folkelig sakramental vækkelse}«, writes Christian Thodberg.\footnote{9} Or, rather, we may see Grundtvig’s accent as marking the possibility that Lutherans, under the influence of a fresh reading of Irenaeus, of Luther, and of the \textit{Confes-sio Augustana}, might turn their existing liturgical movement toward a recovered accent on sacramental presence, on congregational participation, and on social-critical cultural relevance. In such a turn there would be an abiding Lutheran contribution to our common, ecumenical understanding of church.

The possibility of such a turn is present in Grundtvig’s insight. While I would argue that late-twentieth century Lutheran liturgical renewal has come to be exactly about these things – one thinks of the vigorous accents on sacramental recovery, Sunday theology, liturgy and mission, liturgy and social
ethics, and liturgy and culture found in many, world-wide Lutheran circles\textsuperscript{10} – it has had to do so, except in Denmark, largely without the massive intellectual foundations already provided by Grundtvig. The grundtvigian insights have remained, as Joseph Sittler wrote, »a rich and little known strand in the ethos of Lutheranism«,\textsuperscript{11} and they are in need of wider presentation. Even the available hymnic expression of these insights has been softened and obscured. To the extent that Grundtvig’s hymns have been translated, the translations have been frequently marked by pietism or by a sentimental use of language.\textsuperscript{12} And the vigorous forthrightness of »only at the bath and table« does not exist in an English version of Grundtvig’s hymns. Many of Grundtvig’s hymns do indeed require either fresh or first-time translation.

So much is well known to anyone who has read even a little of the prose or the hymns of Grundtvig as they are marked by his \textit{kirkelige anskuelse}, his »churchly view«, and thought about their presentation in the larger world. But what is very much less well known is that the Grundtvig-influenced liturgical movement, the folk-based sacramental awakening, did have an American manifestation. While the small grundtvigian Danish church in late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century North America was intensely creative – founding many folk-schools, for example, and adding its own new hymns and a vigorous new interest in world music to its Danish hymnic heritage – its contributions to American church-life were overshadowed and submerged, first in a bitter and church-dividing battle over the »Word of God«\textsuperscript{13} and then in a continuing and nearly all-consuming concern about the nature of the preservation of Danish language and folk culture in its new setting. Nonetheless, the Danish American church did preserve for us a little text which has had some recent attention among North American Lutheran liturgists.\textsuperscript{14} It is a text worthy of the great poet himself and capable of becoming a symbolic watchword for the best Lutheran contribution to the ecumenical liturgical movement. It is a text with which we may present Grundtvig.

The text is found in one small settlement of Danish immigrants in northwestern Wisconsin, begun in 1869 in Polk County around Little Butternut Lake, and called West Denmark. Seven churches were ultimately built there, a folk-school briefly thrived, and, from 1887-1892, the first theological seminary of the Danish Evangelical Lutheran Church in America was housed in the folk-school building. One of the congregations of this community was (and is) called
West Denmark Lutheran Church. In the steeple of the church building of that congregation there hung, until a tragic church fire in the 1985, an inscribed bell, with the inscription speaking, in the manner of classic bell inscriptions, as if in the first-person of the bell. It is this inscription which concerns us:\(^{15}\)

\[
\begin{align*}
Til \text{ badet og bordet}, \\
Til \text{ bønnen og ordet}, \\
\text{Jeg kalder hver søgende sjæl.}
\end{align*}
\]

(To the bath and the table, 

to the prayer and the word, 

I call every seeking soul.)

Here is a bell which may be seen to function like the bells of Grundtvig’s Kirken den er et gammelt Huus. Here is a little text which has presented something of Grundtvig to North America. Even more, here is a text capable of being used as a summary of an abiding, ecumenical insight into the nature of »church« and an abiding contribution to liturgical renewal.

Indeed, unlike the famous »bath and table« hymn stanza, this bell inscription presents the mageløse opdagelse without polemics. Rather, the pastoral passion and existential address of Grundtvig the preacher speaks here, inviting everyone to come to the great treasure of the living word\(^{16}\). The inscription is obviously Lutheran; it is a vigorous use of the church-definition of the Augsburg Confession:

\[
\text{... at all times there must be and remain one holy Christian church. It is the assembly of all believers among whom the gospel is purely preached and the holy sacraments are administered according to the gospel}.\]

And it is that definition now turned toward invitation and the maintenance of an open door. The inscription can be used to summarize Grundtvig’s »churchly view«. Even more, it can be used to re-think and re-state Grundtvig’s contribution to a continuing ecumenical liturgical movement.

The inscription itself is clear. The bath and the table are the central, church defining actions to which people are invited. They are the gift and institution of Jesus Christ and the heart of Sunday assembly in the crucified and risen Christ.
They are »means of grace«, and »church« is there when these are the central actions. Participation in them will be participation in the mercy of the life-giving Trinity. Every Sunday assembly called together by this bell will be an encounter with this life-giving water – »creeping back to the font«, Luther called it – and a celebration of the meal of this table. »The bath« is our introduction to this assembly, and we come past the bath – are in the reality of the bath again – whenever we are in the assembly. And »the table«, occurring as the heart of the Sunday assembly, is the repeatable part of baptism. In such a way, the bell calls us to »church«.

But then the prayer is also a gift of Jesus Christ and also a way in which humankind is held in the triune life of God, in God’s very embrace. »The prayer«, bønnen, is, most properly, the Lord’s Prayer, that prayer given by Christ and, by the power of the Spirit in the assembly, full of Christ. The Lord’s Prayer, of course, is always prayed as part of coming to the bath, prayed at the bath in that Lutheran liturgy of baptism which the Danish church inherited, prayed throughout the churches as part of the catechetical inheritance of the baptized. The Lord’s Prayer gives us words for being in and of the bath. Furthermore, the Lord’s Prayer gives us words for being at the table, at that place of the bread and forgiveness of God. It is always prayed, in all the churches, in the liturgy of the table. But then »the prayer« is also all prayer, understood in this same way as spoken in the power of the Spirit in and with Jesus Christ before the face of God. The Lord’s Prayer, the prayer of the bath and the table, forms us into intercessory prayer for all the needy world.

The word, then, is the very living word of God sounding throughout all of this assembly, in the grace-filled words of baptism, the supper and the prayer: »I baptize you ... «; »this is my body ... my blood ... given for you«; »give us this day ... [the] bread«; »forgive us ... as we forgive«. »The word« is the biblical word come alive when bath, table and prayer are seen as the hermeneutical key to the scriptures. This was, of course, the very point at which the Danish church in North America faltered, when faced with the fierce biblicism of the American frontier. But the bell echoes Grundtvig. Christian Thodberg writes:

When for example Grundtvig preached on the story of the widow’s son at Nain ... he could maintain that Jesus’ word to the widow, »Do not weep«, and to the dead youth, »Rise up«, cannot naturally relate to us; they were
said to them then. Jesus' presence for us now is to be found in the words of the rite. »I declare«, [says Grundtvig,] »just as surely as Jesus Christ is God's only begotten son, and just as surely as the baptism we are baptized with and the holy communion to which we are invited are instituted by him, so he is also present wherever people are baptized, are fed and nourished, on his behalf with his Word, and it is he himself who speaks to those who hear his voice ... Yes, this is my witness and therefore I have often said and I repeat that the Lord has met his people in the Spirit, as in today's Gospel he met the widow and her only son, has halted the bier and said to the church our mother, do not weep, and by awakening his Word from the dead through the means of grace he has awoken the church's hope and confidence which he in the end is himself, the Word of the living God«.20

And Grundtvig echoes Luther:

When you open the book containing the gospels and read or hear how Christ comes here or there, or how someone is brought to him, you should therein perceive the sermon or the gospel through which he is coming to you, or you are being brought to him.21

And Luther sounds like Ambrose. This conception of the role of the word in the assembly by no means involves the absence of scripture or preaching from the liturgy – witness Grundtvig's own preaching, his own proposals for lectionary reform, and the rich biblical imagery of his hymns! – but rather scripture seen as itself sacramental and liturgical preaching come alive. Indeed, such can be seen as the ancient church's sense of how scripture works in the assembly.

To all of these events on Sunday the bell invites every seeking soul: this is a meal for the hungry, as both Luther and Augustine would say. In fact, it is clear that the bell inscription envisions only »seeking souls« as potentially interested, invited ones here. What happens in the assembly is addressed to seeking humanity, in touch with the actual realities of human life and the actual quests for meaning and for life that mark the depth of our days. The »house of the living word«, by Grundtvig's conception, will echo with songs and actions that speak honestly of human experience, human life and death, at least as surely as did Beowulf's hall, only now its »word-hoard« will be full of the life-
giving speaking of God. This seeking character of our lives corresponds to what Lutherans regularly call »the law«. The event of the assembly needs to take that law seriously and respond with what Lutherans call »the gospel«. Then the very accessibility and existential importance of what occurs in the assembly is underscored the more by the words »bath« and »table«, rather than more ecclesiastically appropriate words. The central events of the Sunday assembly are in critical but lively continuity with human experience and culture, with archetypal and recognizable human events like bathing and communal eating, just as were the meals of Jesus and the primitive Christian use of a great bath to mark the eschatological new beginning. The bell envisions that one comes through the door to a recognizable and attractive event: a real bath, a real meal, prayer before God, and in it all a word that matters for life.

Two other things, less clear, are also implied by the bell inscription. The first involves the role of music: just as the bell calls, musically, rhythmically, to bath, table, prayer and word, so also the music in the assembly itself is not some other, fifth thing. Rather, in the very manner of the Deutsche Messe of Luther and the Danish Højmesse known by Grundtvig, music is the very mode in which the congregation gathers around and participates in the central matters of the assembly. It is not, ought not be, something else.

The other matter is perhaps the most important. The bell remains rather mysterious as to why »every seeking soul« should come to the assembly. The content of the living word, the nature of bath, table and prayer, the presence of the fullness of the gospel and the mercy of the triune God are only known in the experience of the assembly itself, not in talking about the assembly nor in simply hearing the sound of the inviting bell. The actual, participating assembly – as long as it is indeed focused on bath and table, prayer and word – is the enacted theologia prima of the Christian church. There, experiencing this primary theology which engages our seeking, one understands why. It is as if the bell says, »come and see«. But then the »I« of the bell can be seen as something more, something mysterious as well. It is, of course, the bell itself, the actual ringing, inviting sound, so common in a Danish or an old Danish-American community. But it is also the Spirit of God, working on, in and under all these human means, constantly re-constituting the church.

This nineteenth century bell inscription can be seen as having a remarkable continuing resonance with some important notes in the Christian scholarship
and the ecumenical liturgical renewal of the late twentieth century. The inscription itself can be read as a kind of prophecy which spoke on the basis of a central ecclesial heritage. Since the bell was engraved, many churches have been recovering baptism as the foundational act of Christian identity and of the Christian assembly, deeply related to Easter itself. At the same time, many churches have been recovering a practice that makes baptism appear much more clearly as a bath. And the remembrance of baptism throughout the church year and at each Sunday gathering has come to have a widespread importance. Eucharistic practice has similarly been much influenced by reflection on meals: meal regularity and frequency, meal hospitality, meal prayers, the remembrance of the hungry, the use of genuine food, the altar as a communal table, the continuity with the meals of Jesus. Scholarship has found that the actual earliest intention of the Lord’s Prayer, and not only its traditional ritual use, may have envisioned the meal in the church and the mutual announcement of absolution: bread and forgiveness were the presence of the eschaton now, founding and focusing the assembly called »church«. Furthermore, scriptural scholarship increasingly sees the genre »gospel« as implying and presupposing the baptismal and eucharistic assembly. And, in regard to the »seeking souls« and culturally accessible conceptions of bath and table: the central question in vigorous liturgical theology in our time is the appropriate relationship between liturgy and culture.

»To the bath and the table, to the prayer and the word, I call every seeking soul«. This inscription is a text capable of presenting Grundtvig and, at the same time, focusing a needed rethinking of his theology and ecclesiology, not a repristination. But this text also offers a genuine insight into »church« in the present time, an insight capable of deepening and organizing the efforts of contemporary ecumenical liturgical renewal. Were we to take the bell inscription seriously, make it our own, ring it, as it were, at the door of our own assemblies, I think it would imply at least these things:

1. We will need to see to it that our Sunday assemblies are actually centered in bath and table, accessibly present in the heart of participating communities. We will need to see to it that our buildings and our music, our leadership and our liturgies support this centrality and do not obscure it.
2. We will need to accentuate again the awesome importance of Sunday,\textsuperscript{26} the »day full of grace« precisely because it is the day for this life-giving assembly.

3. We will need to encourage each other to continue to work on an existential, sacramental interpretation of scripture in the assembly, an interpretation which addresses all of our honest seeking with life-giving, grace-filled images. We need a word which bathes, a word which we can eat and drink and so live.

4. We will need to work on a kind of participation which is lively – in singing, amen-saying, praying, bathing, eating and drinking – but which does not exclude. The participants are not insiders. All of us, including the ministers at the center of the circle, are seekers. That will need to come to expression in our actual celebration. The theme will be: strong center, open door.

5. We will need to see again – and learn again to articulate clearly – that the God whose life-giving grace for the world lives at the heart of this assembly is triune. The Spirit calls and gathers seeking humanity into the mystery of Christ in the assembly, and so before the face of the One who sent Christ among our wretched need.

6. Then we may be freed to see that »liturgy« always involves a diversity of cultural gifts – in diverse song and diverse texts, diverse human patterns of assembling and departing – gathered around the central things – word, bath, prayer and table – as they are arranged in a meaningful order. Such a freedom will give us tools for authentic liturgical change. Grundtvig’s accent on the central, enduring things of the assembly and his fierce interest in human culture and in the open door provide a rich theoretical basis for the constant inculcation of Christian liturgy.

7. In that freedom, we may be newly and lovingly (if also critically) attentive ourselves to human culture and the deep human questions. The liturgical assembly is set in the midst of God’s beloved world, and it requires honesty, not pretense or lies.

8. And we will be urged to recognize as churches all those assemblies which gather, in their diversity, around the living word in bath and table. We will need to send to them and receive from them signs of our lively communion. So Grundtvig himself wrote:

\begin{quote}
It is indeed high time that all of us who will, in Spirit and truth, be Christians, should ... hold out our hands to one another, and to all the faithful
\end{quote}
who sleep in the Lord, over the font, and exchange the kiss of peace before the altar, and should in the one Bread and the one Cup ... let all disputes over doubtful questions drop ... 27

We will also need to admonish these churches – and ourselves – toward the maintenance of this lively center to our gatherings. In that regard, the counsel of the Faith and Order consultation at Ditchingham (near Norwich) in 1994, sounds grundtvigian:

... the patterns of word and table, of catechetical formation and baptism, of Sunday and the week, of Pascha and the year, and of assembly and ministry around these things ... do give us a basis for a mutually encouraging conversation between the churches. Churches may rightly ask each other about the local inculturation of this ordo. They may call each other toward a maturation in the use of this pattern or a renewed clarification of its central characteristics or, even, toward a conversion to its use. ... All the Christians in a given place, gathered in assembly around these great gifts of Christ, are the whole catholic church dwelling in this place. 28

9. And since all of us are seekers, we may learn to see as well, that none of the orders of our ministers is without flaw. All of them are defective, given our disunity and their calling to guard the unity of the flock. Then we will learn again to welcome all ministries as they serve the living word in the assembly and to find together again in the ministry of bishops a sign of linkage between assemblies and a sign that all the assemblies in a given place have a vocation to be as one assembly around bath and table, prayer and word.

10. And those of us who are Christian scholars will then have a special vocation to two things: to see to it that the Bible and theology are read in the light of the bath and the table and to see to it that the door of this assembly stays open to every seeking soul. The first involves the sacramental, existential hermeneutics of which we have already spoken. The second calls us to turn our scholarship to mission, to the care for the cultures that surround us and to care for the earth, and to the encouragement and protection of the authentic and profound welcome that a celebrating Christian assembly must give to anyone – from among racial, linguistic or sexual minorities, neglected outsiders, wo-
men separated from baptismal dignity – who is drawn to the grace of the triune God. Listen to Grundtvig again:

When it happens that the priests stand at baptism as Zion’s watchers in the power of the Spirit, and the bishop stands at the altar truly representing the Good Shepherd who lays down his life for the sheep, while the congregation gladly lets the light shine in good works, and the learned keep watch over the book with their lamps lit from the flame on the altar and keep watch that the church has open doors for going out as well as for coming in, then is everything in Christian order and then is the Lutheran Reformation complete.29

»To the bath and the table, to the prayer and the word, I call every seeking soul«. Put that West Denmark text next to the »word« of Pius X and you have a shared ecumenical treasure. In fact, it may be that the grundtvigian bell inscription puts the concern of the famous Roman motu proprio with greater clarity and greater existential pungency. Here is a text for presenting Grundtvig to current thought. Here is a vital agenda for continuing ecumenical liturgical reform.

Notes

5. Ibid., 80.


13. For one account, see Enok Mortensen, *Stories From Our Church* (Des Moines: Committee on Publications of the Danish Evangelical Lutheran Church of America, 1952), 94-109.


15. The origin of the bell is unknown, but Edwin Pedersen, a parish historian in Luck, Wisconsin, believes that in the nineteenth century it first hung in the Danish church in Hutchinson, Minnesota, and came to the steeple of the second West Denmark church building in 1938.


18. Christian Thodberg, »The Importance of Baptism in Grundtvig’s View of Christianity«, *Heritage and Prophecy*, 140-142.

19. For an example of the prayer standing next to the bath and the table as places of the presence of God in the assembly, as full of the voice of the Lord, see Grundtvig’s hymn, »Herrens røst var over vandet«, DDS 346.

20. Christian Thodberg, »The Importance of Baptism«, 134.


22. This insight belongs especially to Cantor Mark Mummert of the Lutheran Theological Seminary at Philadelphia.


25. Themes for that rethinking are provided by Jens Holger Schjørring, »Grundtvig, the Oxford Movement and Rationalist Theology«, 230-232: sacramental presence, a method of existential interpretation, change of scenery, historical continuity. Each of these themes could be fruitfully discussed in relationship to our bell inscription.


29. Skal den Lutherske Reformation virkelig fortsættes? (Copenhagen: Schauberg, 1863), 115-116, quoted in Allchin, Ibid., 118; translation altered. About the learned, Grundtvig says: »og de Skrift-Kloge vaage over Bogen med Nat-Lampen tændt ved Alter-Lyset, og vaage over at Kirken har aabne Dørre, til Adgang saavelsom til Indgang ...«.