

R E P O R T S

Two newly discovered sources for the String Quartet in F Major, Opus 44, and the Suite for Piano, Opus 45

There is a well-known challenge, both in (music) research in general and editorial work on music-philological foundations in particular, that there is a moment at which one must “get on with it”, without being sure that one has sufficient knowledge of all the relevant sources. The concept of “all relevant sources” alone is clearly an unmanageably large methodological and philosophical problem, perhaps plainly a self-contradictory challenge. This condition obviously goes for the *Carl Nielsen Edition* too, and there have been instances where it no longer made sense to wait for sources that were missing from the customary source-hierarchy for a work. In the volume containing the String Quartet in F major, opus 44, we described the source situation thus:

The [manuscript] parts formed the basis for the printed parts (A) which were published in 1923, but it is not known whether the study score published the same year (B) was printed on the basis of the parts or was produced from

*a possible ink fair copy of the score which is, however, not known today.*¹

[my italics]

The same went for the so-called *Luciferish Suite*, opus 45; here something similar was said in the preface:

A fair copy of movements 1-4 and 6 survives in the hand of Nancy Dalberg (D) but shows no signs of having been used as the printer’s copy, *which must be presumed lost.*²

[my italics]

Furthermore the edition mentions, in several places in the Critical Commentary, a probable “intermediary source, no longer extant”.

When this was written in 2004 and 2006 respectively, we really did not know whether these sources were preserved, but we do today!

Common to the two works in question is that they were both published by Edition Peters in Leipzig in 1923, and in fact in November 2002 – prior to the

1 *The Carl Nielsen Edition*, II,10, Copenhagen 2004, Preface, I.

2 *The Carl Nielsen Edition*, II,12, Copenhagen 2006, Preface, xxxv.

publication of the two relevant volumes of the Carl Nielsen Edition – we tried to trace the two documents mentioned above by asking the *Sächsisches Staatsarchiv* in Leipzig in writing whether the two manuscripts were to be found in the Editions Peters' archive, held by the Staatsarchiv. As we got no answer, we considered the two manuscript as "verschollen".

It should be added that the two works (and one must assume, therefore, these two particular manuscripts) had originally been sent to Leipzig in 1920, but the publisher refused, in a letter to William Hansen, to publish either of the two works. About the quartet he wrote "[...] that he could not publish such an unoriginal work", and he found the Piano Suite "[...] so unbelievably difficult that it was not suited to making the composer known to a broader circle in Germany",³ Three years later the publisher appears to have changed his mind, and published both works.

At the beginning of 2012, the staff in Leipzig appear to have been in the process of a basic registration of archive material,

in connection with which the *Carl Nielsen Edition* received an approach from a staff member of the archive, Dr Valentin Andert, which touched on these two very manuscripts;⁴ in particular, it had surprised the archive that the *Carl Nielsen Edition* had not discussed these sources in the relevant volume, though we certainly had had our reasons for this flaw. A renewed application to the archive in Leipzig confirmed that the two documents, which we had sought in vain in 2002, were actually to be found there in good health, and with their staff's willing help we have now received digital copies of both autographs. The following description is based upon these digital copies.

Fair copy (autograph) of Quartet for two Violins, Viola and Cello in F Major, Opus 44

DESCRIPTION OF SOURCE

Score, autograph, printing manuscript.

D-LEsta, 21070-5638.

Title page: "Dem Kopenhagener Streichquartett: / Gunnar Breuning / Gerhard Rafn / Ebba Faber / und / Paulus Bache / freundschaftlich gewidmet / Kvartet (f Dur) / for / 2 Violiner, Viola og Violoncello / af / Carl Nielsen / Op 44".

³ "...einen so wenig selbständigen Eindruck in der Erfindung macht, dass ich mich zum Verlag nicht entschliessen kann". ; "...so ungeheuer schwer [...], dass sie nicht eignet, den Komponisten in Deutschland weiteren Kreisen zugänglich zu machen". The letter from Henri Hinrichsen to Wilhelm Hansen is dated 9.10.1920 (CNB Vol. 6, letter 463). It must be supposed that the manuscripts had been sent back to Carl Nielsen in the period between October 1920 and May 1923; cf. CN's letter to Henri Hinrichsen of Peters Edition dated 5.5.1923, in which he says that he had supposed that the two manuscripts with the string quartet and the piano suite respectively, had arrived safely in Leipzig (CNB, Vol. 7, letter 489).

⁴ We should here express our heartfelt thanks to Valentin Andert for contacting the *Carl Nielsen Edition* on the basis of his surprise that these sources were not named in the Edition. Likewise we should thank the present leader of the archive, Dr Thekla Kluttig (who was first appointed after our first, unsuccessful enquiry in 2002) for permission to have the sources digitalised so that they can now be studied by the *Carl Nielsen Edition*.

Title on top of the first music page: "Kvar-
tet for 2 Violiner, Viola og Violoncello /
Carl Nielsen Op 44"; the title crossed out
in pencil and "Quartett" added instead.

35x27 cm.

Paper type: B.&H. No.2.E, 14 staves.

Written in ink with instructions for the
engraver added in pencil.

14 bifolios sewn together, forming one
binding; pages with music paginated 1-56.
Stabilised notepaper line on the front,
which has been damaged.

A comparison between the title page of
this manuscript and the title page of the
handwritten parts (source C in the *Carl
Nielsen Edition's* Description of Sources)
suggests that the parts (C) were written
out from this score.

The score served as printing copy for Edi-
tion Peters' printed score of 1923.

Fair copy (autograph) of Suite for Piano, Opus 45

DESCRIPTION OF SOURCE

Score, autograph, printing manuscript.

D-LEsta, 21070-5639

Title page: "Suite / für / Pianoforte / kom-
poniert / von / Carl Nielsen / Op 45".

Title on top of the first music page: "Suite
/ Carl Nielsen / Op 45".

35,5x27 cm.

Paper type: No. 2, F. 10. 10 staves.

Sewn together, forming one binding.
Paginated 1-35.

Written in ink with instructions for the
engraver added in pencil.

The source served as printing copy for
Edition Peters' printed score of 1923.

Including two typewritten pages,
used as printing copy for the "Vorbe-
merkung" of the printed edition with
numerous pencil corrections in Nielsen's
hand, which later became part of the
printed preface. The typescript carries
dating ("Kopenhagen, 24 April 1923")
and composer's signature in ink.

Hardly any details in the published nota-
tion of *The Carl Nielsen Edition* would have
looked different if these two sources
had laid before the editors in 2004 and
2006, but the discussions of filiation and
source hierarchy would naturally have
been on safer ground.

Additions to the present *List of
Emendations and Editorial Readings* in the
two CNU volumes will be published on the
errata list of CNU on the website: [http://
www.kb.dk/en/kb/nb/mta/cnu/errata.html](http://www.kb.dk/en/kb/nb/mta/cnu/errata.html).

Niels Krabbe